

Appendix

12

From: Annie.Ginwalla@ombudsman-wales.org.uk
Subject: FW: Code of Conduct Investigation - Urgent Received By: workpro@drum.psow.local
To: "Work Pro" (workpro@psow.local) Date Sent: 08/02/2012 09:28:43

From: Howse, Ian (UK - Cardiff) [mailto:ihowse@deloitte.co.uk]
Sent: 07 February 2012 16:37
To: Annie Ginwalla
Subject: RE: Code of Conduct Investigation - Urgent
Sensitivity: Confidential

Dear Annie

Thank you for your e-mail.

I would like to point out that the following response is a personal one from me and in no way represents the opinion of Deloitte LLP my employers. The events referred to; as you acknowledge below relate to a period before my employment by Deloitte LLP,

In respect of attendance note 19 09 08.pdf attached to your e-mail

Generally

1. The events referred to; are according to the note above; nearly 3 and a half years ago and without access to my electronic diary maintained whilst I was in PwC I cannot even confirm the date of the meeting.
2. I have no recollection of ever having seen this attendance note before and PwC have confirmed to me that they have no record of the attendance note.
3. I do not recall having agreed at any stage that they represented a true record of the meeting.
4. There was no agreement that the meeting was to be subject to minutes and thus I would not have sought a copy of this note as I had no knowledge of its existence.
5. I can remember having a meeting with some members of the Cabinet, I do not recall it being the whole Cabinet, where they sought the advice of PwC as to whether they could seek independent legal advice as there were issues of trust between the members present and the Executive Officers in relation to the purchase of Craigwen.
6. I cannot recall for certain but it is unlikely that the Monitoring Officer was present for the whole meeting as described. My recollection is that Gareth Jones and myself had called in on the Managing Director and he suggested the Monitoring Officer join us after we had completed an initial discussion about the Audit Committee

Specifically

7. I have no recollection of having said that Councillor Schofield was spreading poison or indeed that it was personally motivated.
8. I also have no recollection of any discussion concerning the Eversheds investigation and I cannot recall an Eversheds investigation.
9. I do recall on a number of occasions telling the Managing Director (Derrick Jones – I have never

met Mr Bowles) that I would not have wanted his job for a million pounds, however, I cannot recall if I used that phrase in the meeting referred to by the note.

Comments from ES.pdf

I can confirm that I spoke to Councillor Elwyn Schofield on 23 November 2011. He had rung a few days before and left a message requesting that I rang him, he gave no indication of the subject he wished to discuss. When I rang him on 23 he explained he was being investigated by the PSOW in respect of a complaint by the former Managing Director Mr Bowles and he asked me whether I had described him as poison. I said I had no recollection of having done so. He then asked if he could quote me on that in his submission to the PSOW and I agreed that he could.

I can confirm that it was Councillor Schofield that originally brought a number of documents in relation to Craigwen to the attention of PwC as the Council's external auditors. I can also confirm that there were a number of meetings with Councillors on the subject and it was not solely Councillor Schofield taking the lead in those discussions. Correspondence and notes I made at the time will indicate the range of Councillors who were involved and who wrote to PwC on the matter. Indeed the attendance note attached indicates that several members of the Cabinet requested a meeting with us on the issue.

More generally

In respect of my former employers PwC I have confirmed that the most appropriate contact is Lynn Hine.

I should also point out that the Wales Audit Office reviewed materials in relation to the Craigwen case and their Relationship Manager and the Auditor General were regularly updated in respect of the PwC work on Craigwen. They described the relationship between members and officers as "corrosive" in their Annual Audit Letter.

I do not consider it appropriate for me to provide contact details for Mr Jones who is now retired.

Regards

Ian

Ian Howse

Director | Public Sector Audit and Advisory Services
Deloitte LLP
Tel/Direct +44 (0) 29 20 264319
Mobile: +44 (0) 7867902175

Email: ihowse@deloitte.co.uk
Web: www.deloitte.co.uk

Please consider the environment before printing.

